

---

**Monotonicity in Markov  
Reward and Decision  
Chains: Theory and  
Applications**

---

# Monotonicity in Markov Reward and Decision Chains: Theory and Applications

---

**Ger Koole**

*Department of Mathematics  
VU University Amsterdam  
De Boelelaan 1081a  
Amsterdam  
1081 HV  
The Netherlands  
[koole@few.vu.nl](mailto:koole@few.vu.nl)*

**now**

the essence of **know**ledge

Boston – Delft

## Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Stochastic Systems

*Published, sold and distributed by:*

now Publishers Inc.  
PO Box 1024  
Hanover, MA 02339  
USA  
Tel. +1-781-985-4510  
[www.nowpublishers.com](http://www.nowpublishers.com)  
[sales@nowpublishers.com](mailto:sales@nowpublishers.com)

*Outside North America:*

now Publishers Inc.  
PO Box 179  
2600 AD Delft  
The Netherlands  
Tel. +31-6-51115274

The preferred citation for this publication is G. Koole, Monotonicity in Markov Reward and Decision Chains: Theory and Applications, *Foundation and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Stochastic Systems*, vol 1, no 1, pp 1–76, 2006

*Printed on acid-free paper*

ISBN: 978-1-60198-028-1  
© 2007 G. Koole

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission of the publishers.

Photocopying. In the USA: This journal is registered at the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use, or the internal or personal use of specific clients, is granted by now Publishers Inc, for users registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC). The 'services' for users can be found on the internet at: [www.copyright.com](http://www.copyright.com)

For those organizations that have been granted a photocopy license, a separate system of payment has been arranged. Authorization does not extend to other kinds of copying, such as that for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale. In the rest of the world: Permission to photocopy must be obtained from the copyright owner. Please apply to now Publishers Inc., PO Box 1024, Hanover, MA 02339, USA; Tel. +1-781-871-0245; [www.nowpublishers.com](http://www.nowpublishers.com); [sales@nowpublishers.com](mailto:sales@nowpublishers.com)

now Publishers Inc. has an exclusive license to publish this material worldwide. Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright license holder. Please apply to now Publishers, PO Box 179, 2600 AD Delft, The Netherlands, [www.nowpublishers.com](http://www.nowpublishers.com); e-mail: [sales@nowpublishers.com](mailto:sales@nowpublishers.com)

**Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in  
Stochastic Systems**  
Volume 1 Issue 1, 2006  
**Editorial Board**

**Editor-in-Chief:**

**David Yao**

*IEOR Department*

*Columbia University*

*New York, NY 10027-6699*

*USA*

*yao@columbia.edu*

**Editors**

Venkat Ananthamram (UC Berkeley)	Paul Glasserman (Columbia University)
Soren Asmussen (Lund University/ Aarhus University)	Peter Glynn (Stanford University)
Dimitris Bertsimas (MIT)	Debasis Mitra (Bell Laboratories)
Jim Dai (GATech)	Richard Weber (Cambridge University)
Paul Dupuis (Brown University)	

## Editorial Scope

**Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Stochastic Systems** will publish survey and tutorial articles in the following topics:

- Brownian Models
- Logistics and Supply Chain Applications
- Markov Decision Processes
- Mathematical Finance and Insurance
- Point Processes
- Queuing Theory
- Reliability Theory
- Risk Analysis
- Simulation
- Stochastic Control
- Stochastic Networks
- Stochastic Optimization
- Stochastic Programming
- Telecom and Internet Applications

### Information for Librarians

Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in Stochastic Systems, 2006, Volume 1, 4 issues. ISSN paper version 1551-3106. ISSN online version 1551-3092. Also available as a combined paper and online subscription.

Foundations and Trends<sup>®</sup> in  
Stochastic Systems  
Vol. 1, No. 1 (2006) 1–76  
© 2007 G. Koole  
DOI: 10.1561/09000000002



## Monotonicity in Markov Reward and Decision Chains: Theory and Applications

Ger Koole

*Department of Mathematics, VU University Amsterdam, De Boelelaan  
1081a, Amsterdam 1081 HV, The Netherlands, [koole@few.vu.nl](mailto:koole@few.vu.nl)*

### Abstract

This paper focuses on monotonicity results for dynamic systems that take values in the natural numbers or in more-dimensional lattices. The results are mostly formulated in terms of controlled queueing systems, but there are also applications to maintenance systems, revenue management, and so forth. We concentrate on results that are obtained by inductively proving properties of the dynamic programming value function. We give a framework for using this method that unifies results obtained for different models. We also give a comprehensive overview of the results that can be obtained through it, in which we discuss not only (partial) characterizations of optimal policies but also applications of monotonicity to optimization problems and the comparison of systems.

## Contents

---

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>Typical Results</b>	<b>3</b>
2.1	Server-Assignment Models	3
2.2	Routing Models	4
2.3	Bibliographical Notes	6
<b>3</b>	<b>The Framework</b>	<b>7</b>
3.1	A Motivating Example	7
3.2	Operators and Events	10
3.3	Bibliographical Notes	12
<b>4</b>	<b>Criteria and the Environment</b>	<b>15</b>
4.1	Cost Criteria and Markov Decision Processes	15
4.2	The Environment	18
4.3	Continuous Time	19
4.4	Bibliographical Notes	22
<b>5</b>	<b>Operators</b>	<b>23</b>

<b>6 Inequalities</b>	<b>27</b>
6.1 First-Order Conditions	27
6.2 Schur Convexity	29
6.3 Convexity	30
6.4 Bibliographical Notes	32
<b>7 Propagation Results</b>	<b>33</b>
7.1 Environment Operators	33
7.2 Arrival Operators	34
7.3 Departure Operators	38
7.4 Transfer Operators	40
<b>8 Monotonicity of Control</b>	<b>41</b>
8.1 Arrival Operators	41
8.2 Departure Operators	42
8.3 Transfer Operators	43
<b>9 Models</b>	<b>45</b>
9.1 First-Order Conditions	45
9.2 Schur Convexity	48
9.3 Convexity in One Dimension	49
9.4 Convexity in Multiple Dimensions	51
9.5 Convexity in Two Dimensions	53
<b>10 Other State Spaces</b>	<b>57</b>
<b>11 Comparing Systems</b>	<b>61</b>
11.1 Comparing Different Arrival Processes	61
11.2 Monotonicity in Parameters	65
11.3 More-Dimensional Models	71
11.4 Bibliographical Notes	71



<b>12 Conclusions and Future Research Directions</b>	<b>73</b>
<b>References</b>	<b>77</b>

# 1

---

## Introduction

---

Dynamic programming (DP) is a versatile method that can be used to analyze dynamical systems with a possibly stochastic transition mechanism. Above all, it is a numerical method for so-called Markov decision chains (MDCs), in which there are actions to be taken. In systems without actions DP can also be used to find performance indicators (as an alternative to the method that computes the stationary distribution first). These systems are called Markov reward chains, where the reward refers to the performance measure. However, DP can also be used as a theoretical means to obtain certain properties of Markov decision/reward chains. That is the subject of this paper.

The focus in this paper is on dynamic programming methods to obtain monotonicity results for queueing and other types of systems. The results that we obtain for MDCs can be used to characterize, partially or completely, optimal policies. In the context of Markov reward chains we obtain certain monotonicity results in the states, which can then be used in other optimization problems or to compare systems that, for example, differ in certain parameter values. Relevant results that are not obtained through DP are mentioned (but not proven) to give a complete picture.

## References

---

- [1] E. Altman, B. Gaujal, and A. Hordijk, *Discrete-Event Control of Stochastic Networks: Multimodularity and Regularity*. Lecture Notes in Mathematics 1829, Springer, 2003.
- [2] E. Altman, T. Jiménez, and G. M. Koole, “On optimal call admission control in a resource-sharing system,” *IEEE Transactions on Communications*, vol. 49, pp. 1659–1668, 2001.
- [3] E. Altman, T. Jiménez, and G. M. Koole, “On the comparison of queueing systems with their fluid limits,” *Probability in the Engineering and Informational Sciences*, vol. 15, pp. 165–178, 2001.
- [4] E. Altman and G. M. Koole, “Stochastic scheduling games and Markov decision arrival processes,” *Computers and Mathematics with Applications*, vol. 26, no. 6, pp. 141–148, 1993.
- [5] E. Altman and G. M. Koole, “Control of a random walk with noisy delayed information,” *Systems and Control Letters*, vol. 24, pp. 207–213, 1995.
- [6] E. Altman and G. M. Koole, “On submodular value functions and complex dynamic programming,” *Stochastic Models*, vol. 14, pp. 1051–1072, 1998.
- [7] E. Altman and P. Nain, “Closed-loop control with delayed information,” *Performance Evaluation Review*, vol. 20, pp. 193–204, 1992.
- [8] E. Altman and S. Stidham Jr., “Optimality of monotonic policies for two-action markovian decision processes, with applications to control of queues with delayed information,” *Queueing Systems*, vol. 21, pp. 267–291, 1995.
- [9] M. Armony, E. Plambeck, and S. Seshadri, “Convexity properties and comparative statics for M/M/S queues with balking and reneging,” Working paper, 2006.

## 78 References

- [10] D. Artiges, "Optimal routing into two heterogeneous service stations with delayed information," *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, vol. 40, pp. 1234–1236, 1995.
- [11] S. Asmussen and G. M. Koole, "Marked point processes as limits of Markovian arrival streams," *Journal of Applied Probability*, vol. 30, pp. 365–372, 1993.
- [12] J. S. Baras, D.-J. Ma, and A. M. Makowski, " $K$  competing queues with geometric service requirements and linear costs: The  $\mu c$ -rule is always optimal," *Systems and Control Letters*, vol. 6, pp. 173–180, 1985.
- [13] S. Benjaafar, W. L. Cooper, and S. Mardan, *Production-inventory systems with imperfect advance demand information and due-date updates*. Technical report, University of Minnesota, 2005. Working Paper.
- [14] S. Benjaafar and M. ElHafsi, "Production and inventory control of a single product assemble-to-order system with multiple customer classes," *Management Science*, vol. 52, pp. 1896–1912, 2006.
- [15] F. J. Beutler and D. Teneketzis, "Routing in queueing networks under imperfect information: Stochastic dominance and thresholds," *Stochastics and Stochastics Reports*, vol. 26, pp. 81–100, 1989.
- [16] J. P. C. Blanc, P. R. de Waal, P. Nain, and D. Towsley, "Optimal control of admission to a multiserver queue with two arrival streams," *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, pp. 785–797, 1992.
- [17] G. Brouns and J. van der Wal, "Optimal threshold policies in a two-class preemptive priority queue with admission and termination control," *Queueing Systems*, vol. 54, pp. 21–33, 2006.
- [18] C. Buyukkoc, P. Varaiya, and J. Walrand, "The  $c\mu$  rule revisited," *Advances in Applied Probability*, vol. 17, pp. 237–238, 1985.
- [19] C. S. Chang, X. Chao, M. Pinedo, and R. R. Weber, "On the optimality of LEPT and  $c\mu$ -rules for machines in parallel," *Journal of Applied Probability*, vol. 29, pp. 667–681, 1992.
- [20] M. Chen, C. Pandit, and S. Meyn, "In search of sensitivity in network optimization," *Queueing Systems*, vol. 44, pp. 313–363, 2003.
- [21] E. B. Çil, E. L. Örmeci, and F. Karaesmen, "Effects of system parameters on the optimal policy structure in a class of queueing control problems," Working paper, 2007.
- [22] F. de Véricourt and Y.-P. Zhou, "On the incomplete results for the heterogeneous server problem," *Queueing Systems*, vol. 52, pp. 189–191, 2006.
- [23] C. Derman, G. J. Lieberman, and S. M. Ross, "On the optimal assignment of servers and a repairman," *Journal of Applied Probability*, vol. 17, pp. 577–581, 1980.
- [24] M. C. Fu, S. I. Marcus, and I.-J. Wang, "Monotone optimal policies for a transient queueing staffing problem," *Operations Research*, vol. 48, pp. 327–331, 2000.
- [25] H. A. Ghoneim and S. Stidham Jr., "Control of arrivals to two queues in series," *European Journal of Operational Research*, vol. 21, pp. 399–409, 1985.
- [26] P. Glasserman and D. D. Yao, "Monotone optimal control of permutable GSMPs," *Mathematics of Operations Research*, vol. 19, pp. 449–476, 1994.

- [27] P. Glasserman and D. D. Yao, *Monotone Structure in Discrete Event Systems*. Wiley, 1994.
- [28] B. Hajek, "Optimal control of two interacting service stations," *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, vol. 29, pp. 491–499, 1984.
- [29] B. Hajek, "Extremal splitting of point processes," *Mathematics of Operations Research*, vol. 10, pp. 543–556, 1985.
- [30] R. Hariharan, V. G. Kulkarni, and S. Stidham Jr., "Optimal control of two parallel infinite-server queues," in *Proceedings of the 29th CDC*, (IEEE, ed.), pp. 1329–1335, 1990.
- [31] A. Hordijk and G. M. Koole, "On the optimality of the generalized shortest queue policy," *Probability in the Engineering and Informational Sciences*, vol. 4, pp. 477–487, 1990.
- [32] A. Hordijk and G. M. Koole, "On the assignment of customers to parallel queues," *Probability in the Engineering and Informational Sciences*, vol. 6, pp. 495–511, 1992.
- [33] A. Hordijk and G. M. Koole, "On the optimality of LEPT and  $\mu c$  rules for parallel processors and dependent arrival processes," *Advances in Applied Probability*, vol. 25, pp. 979–996, 1993.
- [34] A. A. Jagers and E. A. van Doorn, "Convexity of functions which are generalizations of the Erlang loss function and the Erlang delay function: Problem 90-8," *SIAM Review*, vol. 33, pp. 281–282, 1991.
- [35] P. K. Johri, "Optimality of the shortest line discipline with state-dependent service times," *European Journal of Operational Research*, vol. 41, pp. 157–161, 1989.
- [36] J. Kimemia and S. B. Gershwin, "An algorithm for the computer control of a flexible manufacturing system," *Modeling and control of automated manufacturing systems table of contents*, pp. 119–128, 1989.
- [37] G. P. Klimov, "Time-sharing service systems I," *Theory of Probability and its Applications*, vol. 19, pp. 532–551, 1974.
- [38] G. M. Koole, "Optimal server assignment in the case of service times with monotone failure rates," *Systems and Control Letters*, vol. 20, pp. 233–238, 1993.
- [39] G. M. Koole, *Stochastic Scheduling and Dynamic Programming*. CWI Tract 113, Amsterdam: CWI, 1995.
- [40] G. M. Koole, "Structural results for the control of queueing systems using event-based dynamic programming," *Queueing Systems*, vol. 30, pp. 323–339, 1998.
- [41] G. M. Koole, "A transformation method for stochastic control problems with partial observations," *Systems and Control Letters*, vol. 35, pp. 301–308, 1998.
- [42] G. M. Koole, "Stochastic scheduling with event-based dynamic programming," *Mathematical Methods of Operations Research*, vol. 51, pp. 249–261, 2000.
- [43] G. M. Koole, "Redefining the service level in call centers," Working paper, 2003.
- [44] G. M. Koole, "Convexity in tandem queues," *Probability in the Engineering and Informational Sciences*, vol. 18, pp. 13–31, 2004.

80 *References*

- [45] G. M. Koole and Z. Liu, "Stochastic bounds for queueing systems with multiple on-off sources," *Probability in the Engineering and Informational Sciences*, vol. 12, pp. 25–48, 1998.
- [46] G. M. Koole, P. D. Sparaggis, and D. Towsley, "Minimizing response times and queue lengths in systems of parallel queues," *Journal of Applied Probability*, vol. 36, pp. 1185–1193, 1999.
- [47] G. Koole and M. Vrijenhoek, "Scheduling a repairman in a finite source system," *Mathematical Methods of Operations Research*, vol. 44, pp. 333–344, 1996.
- [48] J. Kuri and A. Kumar, "Optimal control of arrivals to queues with delayed queue length information," in *Proceedings of the 31th IEEE Conference on Decision and Control*, 1992.
- [49] H. M. Liang and V. G. Kulkarni, "Optimal routing control in retrial queues," in *Applied Probability and Stochastic Processes*, (J. G. Shanthikumar and U. Sumita, eds.), Kluwer, 1999.
- [50] W. Lin and P. R. Kumar, "Optimal control of a queueing system with two heterogeneous servers," *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, vol. 29, pp. 696–703, 1984.
- [51] S. A. Lippman, "Applying a new device in the optimization of exponential queueing systems," *Operations Research*, vol. 23, pp. 687–710, 1975.
- [52] Z. Liu, P. Nain, and D. Towsley, "Sample path methods in the control of queues," *Queueing Systems*, vol. 21, pp. 293–335, 1995.
- [53] L. Liyanage and J. G. Shanthikumar, "Second-order properties of single-stage queueing systems," in *Queueing and Related Models*, (U. N. Bhat and I. S. Basawa, eds.), pp. 129–160, Oxford, 1992.
- [54] A. W. Marshall and I. Olkin, *Inequalities: Theory of Majorization and its Applications*. Academic Press, 1979.
- [55] R. Menich and R. F. Serfozo, "Monotonicity and optimality of symmetric parallel processing systems," *Queueing Systems*, vol. 9, pp. 403–418, 1991.
- [56] N. Miyoshi, M. Ohnishi, and N. Okino, "Optimal service control of a station connected with two parallel substations," *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, vol. 38, pp. 1567–1572, 1993.
- [57] A. Müller, "On a conjecture of Koole," *Probability in the Engineering and Informational Sciences*, vol. 12, pp. 141–142, 1998.
- [58] A. Müller and M. Scarsini, "Stochastic comparison of random vectors with a common copula," *Mathematics of Operations Research*, vol. 26, pp. 723–740, 2001.
- [59] P. Nain, "Interchange arguments for classical scheduling problems in queues," *Systems and Control Letters*, vol. 12, pp. 177–184, 1989.
- [60] P. Nain, "Qualitative properties of the Erlang blocking model with heterogeneous user requirements," *Queueing Systems*, vol. 6, pp. 189–206, 1990.
- [61] J. Ni, H. K. Tsang, S. Tatikonda, and B. Bensaou, "Threshold and reservation based call admission control policies for multiservice resource-sharing systems," in *Proceedings of INFOCOM*, pp. 773–783, IEEE, 2005.
- [62] M. Nuyens and A. Wierman, "The foreground-background processor-sharing queue: A survey," 2004.

- [63] E. L. Örmeci and A. Burnetas, “Dynamic admission control for loss systems with batch arrivals,” *Advances in Applied Probability*, vol. 37, pp. 915–937, 2005.
- [64] E. L. Örmeci, A. Burnetas, and J. van der Wal, “Admission policies for a two class loss system,” *Stochastic Models*, vol. 17, pp. 513–540, 2001.
- [65] M. L. Puterman, *Markov Decision Processes*. Wiley, 1994.
- [66] R. Ramjee, R. Nagarajan, and D. Towsley, “On optimal call admission control in cellular networks,” in *Proceedings of IEEE Infocom '96*, pp. 43–50, 1996.
- [67] R. Richter and J. G. Shanthikumar, “Scheduling multiclass single server queueing systems to stochastically maximize the number of successful departures,” *Probability in the Engineering and Informational Sciences*, vol. 3, pp. 323–333, 1989.
- [68] K. W. Ross and D. H. K. Tsang, “The stochastic knapsack problem,” *IEEE Transactions on Communications*, vol. 37, pp. 740–747, 1989.
- [69] K. W. Ross and D. D. Yao, “Monotonicity properties for the stochastic knapsack,” *IEEE Transactions on Information Theory*, vol. 36, pp. 1173–1179, 1990.
- [70] R. Serfozo, “An equivalence between continuous and discrete time Markov decision processes,” *Operations Research*, vol. 27, pp. 616–620, 1979.
- [71] M. Shaked and J. G. Shanthikumar, “Parametric stochastic convexity and concavity of stochastic processes,” *Annals of the Institute of Statistical Mathematics*, vol. 42, pp. 509–531, 1990.
- [72] D. Song and Y. Sun, “Optimal control structure of an unreliable manufacturing system with random demands,” in *Proceedings of the 35th CDC*, pp. 4552–4557, IEEE, 1996.
- [73] S. Stidham Jr., “Socially and individually optimal control of arrivals to a  $GI|M|1$  queue,” *Management Science*, vol. 24, pp. 1598–1610, 1978.
- [74] S. Stidham Jr., “Optimal control of admission to a queueing system,” *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, vol. 30, pp. 705–713, 1985.
- [75] S. Stidham Jr., “Analysis, design, and control of queueing systems,” *Operations Research*, vol. 30, pp. 705–713, 2002.
- [76] S. Stidham Jr. and R. R. Weber, “Monotonic and insensitive optimal policies for control of queues with undiscounted costs,” *Operations Research*, vol. 37, pp. 611–625, 1989.
- [77] S. Stidham Jr. and R. R. Weber, “A survey of Markov decision models for control of networks of queues,” *Queueing Systems*, vol. 13, pp. 291–314, 1993.
- [78] J.-B. Suk and C. G. Cassandras, “optimal scheduling of two competing queues with blocking,” *IEEE Transactions on Automatic Control*, vol. 36, pp. 1086–1091, 1991.
- [79] N. M. van Dijk, “On the finite horizon Bellman equation for controlled Markov jump models with unbounded characteristics: Existence and approximations,” *Stochastic Processes and their Applications*, vol. 28, pp. 141–157, 1988.
- [80] Á. Varga, “Monotonicity properties of single server queues,” Master’s thesis, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam, 2002.
- [81] M. H. Veatch and L. Wein, “Monotone control of queueing networks,” *Queueing Systems*, vol. 12, pp. 391–408, 1992.
- [82] J. Walrand, *An Introduction to Queueing Networks*. Prentice-Hall, 1988.

82 *References*

- [83] R. R. Weber and S. Stidham Jr., "Optimal control of service rates in networks of queues," *Advances in Applied Probability*, vol. 19, pp. 202–218, 1987.
- [84] J. Weishaupt, "Optimal myopic policies and index policies for stochastic scheduling problems," *Mathematical Methods of Operations Research*, vol. 40, pp. 75–89, 1994.
- [85] W. L. Winston, "Optimality of the shortest line discipline," *Journal of Applied Probability*, vol. 14, pp. 181–189, 1977.