

Online Appendix for
Are Climate Negotiations Making Any Progress?

Thomas Sterner and Samson Mukanjari

Table A1: A history of the Conference of the Parties (COP) to the UNFCCC

| Event | Year | Country | Goal/expectation | Results | Discrepancy |
|--------------------|------|-------------------------|--|---|---|
| Founding of UNFCCC | 1992 | Rio de Janeiro, Brazil | Adopt a Convention to take measures to prevent 'dangerous' human interference with the climate system. Coordinate global efforts for climate change adaptation. | Parties obliged to act in the interests of human safety regardless of scientific uncertainty. Developed countries commit to reducing GHG emissions to their 1990 levels by 2000, and to provide the financial resources needed by developing countries to mitigate climate change. | |
| COP1 | 1995 | Berlin, Germany | Stocktaking Launch negotiations to strengthen global response to climate change. | Parties agree to meet annually to discuss climate change and assess global efforts to limit emissions. | |
| COP2 | 1996 | Geneva, Switzerland | Stocktaking Establish the basis for negotiating a global response to climate change. | Parties agree to work towards establishing binding quantitative targets for Annex I countries. | |
| COP3 | 1997 | Kyoto, Japan | Stocktaking Establish a legally binding agreement to reduce GHG emissions. | Kyoto Protocol adopted. Parties agree to establish market-based mechanisms for emissions reductions. | Only Annex I countries have binding emissions targets. Agreed targets below IPCC scientific targets. |
| COP4 | 1998 | Buenos Aires, Argentina | Stocktaking Develop a rulebook (implementation guidelines) for the Kyoto Protocol. | Parties agree on key details of the Kyoto Protocol rulebook including establishing rules for market-based mechanisms. | Only two developing countries, Argentina and Kazakhstan, commit to set binding emissions targets. |
| COP5 | 1999 | Bonn, Germany | Stocktaking Finalize implementation guidelines of the Kyoto Protocol. | Parties make progress in developing the market-based mechanisms of the Kyoto Protocol. Parties commit to accelerating discussions to put Kyoto Protocol into practice. Argentina announces a binding emissions target for 2008-2012. | |

| Event | Year | Country | Goal/expectation | Results | Discrepancy |
|--------|------|-------------------------|---|--|---|
| | | | | Kazakhstan formally requests to be included in Annex I of the UNFCCC. | |
| COP6 | 2000 | The Hague, Netherlands | Stocktaking Finalize the implementation guidelines of the Kyoto Protocol to prepare it for ratification. | No consensus among Parties around the use of flexibility mechanisms necessitating another round of negotiations as part of COP6 the following year. | |
| COP6-2 | 2001 | Bonn, Germany | Stocktaking Establish a consensus on rules for the Kyoto Protocol's implementation to prepare it for ratification. | Parties reach consensus on the rules for implementing the Kyoto Protocol. Parties establish the Adaptation Fund, the Least Developed Countries Fund, and the Special Climate Change Fund. | |
| COP7 | 2001 | Marrakech, Morocco | Stocktaking Create an institutional framework for the Kyoto Protocol's entry into force. | Rules for implementing the Kyoto Protocol resolved. | |
| COP8 | 2002 | New Delhi, India | Stocktaking Negotiate implementation of Kyoto Protocol. | No significant progress on the implementation of the Kyoto Protocol. The Delhi Declaration is issued, emphasizing the development needs of developing countries. | No commitment from developing countries to adopt targets for Kyoto Protocol's second commitment period. Neither Russia nor the U.S. have ratified the Kyoto Protocol for it to enter into force. |
| COP9 | 2003 | Milan, Italy | Stocktaking Negotiate implementation of the Kyoto Protocol. | No progress on the implementation of the Kyoto Protocol. | |
| COP10 | 2004 | Buenos Aires, Argentina | Stocktaking Negotiate implementation of the Kyoto Protocol. | Russia ratifies Kyoto Protocol ahead of COP10. | Minimal progress on implementation of Kyoto Protocol despite Russia's ratification. |
| COP11 | 2005 | Montreal, Canada | Stocktaking | Kyoto Protocol enters into force. | Kyoto Protocol enters into force without the U.S. and Australia. |

| Event | Year | Country | Goal/expectation | Results | Discrepancy |
|-------|------|---------------------|---|---|---|
| | | | Negotiate implementation of the Kyoto Protocol. | Parties create the first tentative process to discuss the continuation of the Kyoto Protocol after the end of the first commitment period in 2012. | |
| COP12 | 2006 | Nairobi, Kenya | Stocktaking Negotiate the Kyoto Protocol's second commitment period. | Parties review implementation of the Kyoto Protocol. Parties establish modalities for the Adaptation Fund. Developing countries agree to undertake mitigation efforts with support from developed countries. | |
| COP13 | 2007 | Bali, Indonesia | Stocktaking Establish timetable for negotiations for a successor to the Kyoto Protocol, which includes commitments from all countries. | Details on the Adaptation Fund's operationalization agreed. Parties agree on the Bali Road Map and the Bali Action Plan. Parties agree to a two-year negotiation process to reach a post-2012 agreement in Copenhagen. | |
| COP14 | 2008 | Poznan, Poland | Stocktaking Finalize the details of the Bali Action Plan. | Adaptation Fund operationalized. Parties make progress on key details of the Bali Action Plan. | |
| COP15 | 2009 | Copenhagen, Denmark | Establish a global climate agreement to replace the Kyoto Protocol in 2012. | No new global climate agreement reached. Goal to keep global temperature rise below 2 °C validated. Developing countries agree to implement mitigation actions. Parties commit to providing \$100 billion annually for climate action by 2020. | No corresponding commitments by the Parties to support the temperature goal in the Copenhagen Accord. Recommendations that the Accord be revised by 2015 to meet long-term climate goals aimed at limiting temperature increase to 1.5 °C. The Accord delays climate action, making mitigation efforts increasingly difficult. |

| Event | Year | Country | Goal/expectation | Results | Discrepancy |
|-------|------|----------------------|--|--|---|
| COP16 | 2010 | Cancun, Mexico | Stocktaking | Cancun Agreements made, formalizing commitments from COP15. Green Climate Fund (GCF) established to fund adaptation and mitigation in developing countries. | Only \$30 billion committed to climate action. No details about how the GCF will be funded. |
| COP17 | 2011 | Durban, South Africa | Stocktaking Establish firm commitments by the Parties to start reducing carbon emissions. | Parties agree to negotiate and establish a new global agreement by 2015, to come into force in 2020. Parties make progress on operationalizing the GCF. | |
| COP18 | 2012 | Doha, Qatar | Stocktaking Negotiate the second commitment period of the Kyoto Protocol and establish a new legally binding universal agreement by 2020. | Doha Amendment adds a second commitment period (2013–2020) to the Kyoto Protocol. Parties commit to establishing an international mechanism to address loss and damage. | |
| COP19 | 2013 | Warsaw, Poland | Stocktaking | Warsaw International Mechanism for Loss and Damage (L&D) established. Parties make preparations to negotiate a new universal global treaty in 2015. | |
| COP20 | 2014 | Lima, Peru | Stocktaking Preparatory work for a new climate agreement for Paris 2015. | Parties issue the Lima Call for Climate Action. Parties agree to develop and share their Intended Nationally Determined Contributions (INDCs) ahead of Paris. | |
| COP21 | 2015 | Paris, France | Establish a universal global agreement to limit global warming to 2 °C. | Paris Agreement adopted. Parties reiterate the COP15 goal to provide funds for climate action and extend it to 2025. | Pledges not in line with the temperature goal. No policy instruments stipulated to achieve the goal of reducing emissions. |

| Event | Year | Country | Goal/expectation | Results | Discrepancy |
|-------|------|-----------------------------------|---|---|---|
| COP22 | 2016 | Marrakech, Morocco | Stocktaking | Marrakech Action Proclamation reaffirm global commitment to the Paris Agreement. Five-year workplan on L&D approved. Developed countries reaffirm commitment to provide \$100 billion annually for climate action. | No agreement on extending the Kyoto Protocol Adaptation Fund to cover Paris Agreement. |
| COP23 | 2017 | Bonn, Germany | Stocktaking Negotiate the rules for implementing the Paris Agreement. | Progress made on developing the Paris Rulebook. Kyoto Protocol Adaptation Fund extended to serve the Paris Agreement. Developed countries reaffirm commitment to provide \$100 billion annually for climate action. | Paris Rulebook still unfinished. |
| COP24 | 2018 | Katowice, Poland | Stocktaking Negotiate the rules for implementing the Paris Agreement. | Parties make progress on most aspects of the Paris Rulebook. | No agreement on operationalizing Article 6 of the Paris Agreement, permitting the development of carbon markets. No agreement on L&D. Summit sponsored by major coal companies. |
| COP25 | 2019 | Madrid, Spain | Stocktaking Negotiate the rules for implementing the Paris Agreement. | No agreement on Article 6, which provides guidelines on a global carbon market. | |
| COP26 | 2021 | Glasgow, UK, and Northern Ireland | Stocktaking Finalize Paris Rulebook. Mobilize at least \$100 billion annually in climate finance. | Paris Rulebook finalized including Article 6. 110 countries sign the Global Methane Pledge to cut methane emissions by 30% over the next decade. | No commitment to phase-out coal by all Parties. |

| Event | Year | Country | Goal/expectation | Results | Discrepancy |
|-------|------|-----------------------------|------------------|---|--|
| | | | | <p>Parties adopt a commitment to phase down coal.</p> <p>Sixty-five countries commit to phasing out coal.</p> <p>Parties commit to double climate finance.</p> <p>Developed countries reaffirm commitment to provide \$100 billion annually for climate action.</p> | |
| COP27 | 2022 | Sharm el-Sheikh, Egypt | Stocktaking | <p>Parties commit to create a fund to compensate for L&D.</p> <p>Creation of African carbon market.</p> | <p>No commitment to phase down all fossil fuels.</p> <p>No agreement on how or from where L&D financing should originate.</p> |
| COP28 | 2023 | Dubai, United Arab Emirates | Global stocktake | <p>First global stocktake.</p> <p>L&D Fund operationalized.</p> <p>Parties commit to transition away from fossil fuels.</p> | <p>Global stocktake shows climate action has not progressed enough in all areas.</p> <p>No additional funds allocated for adaptation nor transitioning to a low-carbon economy.</p> <p>No commitment to phase out fossil fuels.</p> <p>Initial pledges to the L&D Fund insignificant compared to needs.</p> <p>Summit features record number of fossil fuel representatives.</p> |

Source: United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC), Conference of the Parties documentation, and Skidmore and Farrell (2023)