

The Unintended Consequences of Nation-Making Institutions for Civil Society Development

Tugba Bozcaga* and Asli Cansunar †

Sep 22, 2021

Appendix

*The Department of European & International Studies, Bush House, North East Wing, 30 Aldwych, London, WC2B 4BG, UK; Tugba.bozcaga@kcl.ac.uk

†Department of Political Science, University of Washington, 107 Gowen Hall, Seattle, WA 98195; cansunar@uw.edu

Appendix

Table of Contents

Appendices	A1
A Summary Statistics	A2
B Full Tables	A3
C Additional Checks	A4

A Summary Statistics

Table A1

Statistic	N	Mean	St. Dev.	Min	Pctl(25)	Pctl(75)	Max
People's Houses (number)	970	0.410	0.596	0	0	1	6
Associations (per 10k)	970	13.882	8.048	0.000	8.624	17.410	82.071
Islamist Association (IYC)	970	0.174	0.380	0	0	0	1
Islamist vote share (1972)	970	12.039	9.375	0.187	5.163	16.536	66.178
AKP vote share	970	33.238	15.896	1.703	20.067	44.247	94.196
Endowments (per 10k)	970	0.818	0.890	0.000	0.299	0.975	7.266
Public education buildings (per 10k)	969	7.894	6.926	0.127	3.594	10.018	83.094
Public health buildings (per 10k)	969	1.457	1.394	0.000	0.538	1.886	11.862
Public religious buildings (per 10k)	969	5.725	6.266	0.000	2.068	7.316	76.923
Private schools (per 10k)	970	0.449	0.915	0	0	0.6	12
Conservativeness (F/M Literacy)	970	14.067	200.046	0.005	3.916	5.821	4,437.389
Literacy rate	970	93.287	4.400	75.453	90.719	96.726	99.573
Nighlights density	970	3.336	12.119	0.007	0.265	1.242	138.556
Nationalist vote share	970	9.581	5.851	0.000	5.685	12.099	49.529
Population (log)	970	10.421	1.302	7.418	9.482	11.311	13.725
Provincial/urban center	970	0.191	0.393	0	0	0	1

B Full Tables

Table A2

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
People's Houses (number)	1.448*** (0.426)	1.646*** (0.479)	0.070*** (0.026)	0.066*** (0.023)
Endowments (per 10k)	2.358*** (0.788)	2.009*** (0.612)	0.031 (0.025)	0.026 (0.023)
Public education buildings (per 10k)	0.055 (0.078)	0.058 (0.065)	-0.003* (0.002)	-0.003* (0.002)
Public health buildings (per 10k)	0.501* (0.286)	0.528** (0.251)	-0.003 (0.005)	-0.001 (0.006)
Public religious buildings (per 10k)	-0.041 (0.068)	-0.045 (0.048)	-0.001 (0.001)	0.001 (0.001)
Private schools (per 10k)	0.374 (0.314)	0.110 (0.203)	0.0004 (0.015)	0.005 (0.011)
Conservativeness (F/M Literacy)	0.0001 (0.0004)	0.001** (0.0005)	-0.00004* (0.00002)	-0.00004*** (0.00001)
Literacy rate	0.431*** (0.113)	0.127 (0.137)	0.001 (0.002)	0.003 (0.003)
Nighlights density	0.031 (0.032)	0.041 (0.031)	-0.002* (0.001)	-0.004*** (0.001)
AKP vote share	0.078** (0.038)	0.011 (0.029)	0.002** (0.001)	0.003** (0.001)
Nationalist vote share	-0.082* (0.047)	0.001 (0.037)	0.002 (0.002)	0.003 (0.002)
Islamist vote share (1972)	-0.037 (0.047)	0.050* (0.030)	-0.0002 (0.001)	-0.0004 (0.001)
Population (log)	-0.849* (0.483)	-0.387 (0.279)	0.083*** (0.022)	0.103*** (0.021)
Provincial/urban center	2.985*** (0.794)	3.348*** (0.615)	0.355*** (0.062)	0.317*** (0.058)
Controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Province Fixed Effects	No	Yes	No	Yes
Observations	969	969	969	969
R ²	0.246	0.538	0.365	0.442
Adjusted R ²	0.235	0.488	0.356	0.382
Residual Std. Error	7.044 (df = 954)	5.761 (df = 874)	0.304 (df = 954)	0.298 (df = 874)

Note: Standard errors clustered by province. *p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

C Additional Checks

Table A3

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>			
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
People's Houses (number)	-0.557 (0.553)	-0.616 (0.398)	-1.442 (1.107)	-0.308 (0.546)
Endowments (per 10k)	0.418 (0.530)	0.109 (0.383)	0.262 (0.925)	-0.821 (0.689)
Public education buildings (per 10k)	-0.221*** (0.049)	-0.142*** (0.044)	-0.415*** (0.096)	-0.212*** (0.074)
Public health buildings (per 10k)	0.502** (0.244)	-0.085 (0.166)	0.655 (0.497)	-0.670** (0.333)
Public religious buildings (per 10k)	0.245*** (0.080)	0.215*** (0.055)	0.793*** (0.150)	0.445*** (0.074)
Private schools (per 10k)	-0.919*** (0.264)	-0.313** (0.130)	-1.125 (1.121)	-0.942 (0.646)
Conservativeness (F/M Literacy)	-0.001* (0.0004)	-0.001*** (0.0004)	0.003* (0.002)	0.002*** (0.0003)
Literacy rate	-0.430*** (0.140)	-0.030 (0.125)	-0.027 (0.337)	0.029 (0.269)
Nighlights density	-0.088*** (0.029)	-0.013 (0.021)	-0.021 (0.052)	-0.015 (0.028)
Nationalist vote share	-0.085 (0.083)	-0.084 (0.083)	-0.276* (0.156)	-0.420*** (0.111)
Population (log)	0.419 (0.475)	0.548 (0.335)	0.552 (1.107)	0.662 (0.699)
Provincial/urban center	3.649*** (1.162)	2.146** (0.857)	4.022** (2.034)	3.069** (1.189)
Constant	48.078*** (13.483)		30.551 (30.351)	
Controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Province Fixed Effects	No	Yes	No	Yes
Observations	969	969	969	969
R ²	0.101	0.539	0.090	0.681
Adjusted R ²	0.090	0.491	0.078	0.647
Residual Std. Error	8.943 (df = 956)	6.691 (df = 876)	15.266 (df = 956)	9.444 (df = 876)

Note: Standard errors clustered by province. *p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01

Table A4: Controlled Direct Effect of People’s Houses by Model

Potential Collider	β with 95% Confidence Interval
Endowments (per 10k)	1.326 [0.641, 2.143]
Public education buildings (per 10k)	1.004 [0.246, 2.180]
Public health buildings (per 10k)	1.091 [0.337, 2.283]
Public religious buildings (per 10k)	0.911 [0.099, 1.990]
Private schools (per 10k)	0.888 [0.116, 2.025]
Conservativeness (F/M Literacy)	0.870 [0.125, 2.036]
Literacy rate	0.861 [0.097, 2.091]
Nightlights density	0.863 [0.203, 1.902]
AKP vote share	0.927 [0.133, 2.126]
Nationalist vote share	0.906 [0.167, 1.961]
Islamist vote share (1972)	0.916 [0.201, 2.191]
Population (log)	1.188 [0.340, 2.254]

Each row represents a different model, where the variable name in Column 1 indicates which 'post-treatment' control variable is assumed to be a collider in the model. The models includes the full set of controls as well as province fixed effects. The estimates and confidence intervals (95%), calculated by nonparametric bootstrap standard errors clustered by province, for the controlled direct effect of People’s Houses is reported in Column 2.

Table A5

	<i>Dependent variable:</i>	
	(1)	(2)
People's Houses (number)	1.491*** (0.436)	1.818*** (0.482)
Istanbul- Izmir provinces	-0.989 (1.173)	(0.000)
People's Houses (number) × Istanbul- Izmir provinces	-0.301 (0.996)	-0.841 (1.197)
Endowments (per 10k)	2.346*** (0.781)	2.036*** (0.624)
Public education buildings (per 10k)	0.053 (0.078)	0.057 (0.064)
Public health buildings (per 10k)	0.501* (0.287)	0.534** (0.250)
Public religious buildings (per 10k)	-0.042 (0.069)	-0.046 (0.048)
Private schools (per 10k)	0.436 (0.330)	0.101 (0.198)
Conservativeness (F/M Literacy)	0.0001 (0.0004)	0.001** (0.0004)
Literacy rate	0.436*** (0.115)	0.126 (0.137)
Nightlights density	0.045 (0.032)	0.045 (0.033)
AKP vote share	0.076** (0.038)	0.011 (0.029)
Nationalist vote share	-0.086* (0.048)	-0.001 (0.037)
Islamist vote share	-0.039 (0.047)	0.052* (0.030)
Population (log)	-0.874* (0.477)	-0.409 (0.282)
Provincial/urban center	3.018*** (0.823)	3.313*** (0.625)
Constant	-23.230** (9.959)	
Controls	Yes	Yes
Province Fixed Effects	No	Yes
Observations	969	969
R ²	0.246	0.538
Adjusted R ²	0.234	0.488
Residual Std. Error	7.048 (df = 952)	5.761 (df = 873)
<i>Note:</i>	*p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01	